pISSN 2798-2106 eISSN 2808-4470

Studi Ilmu Sosial Indonesia
Vol. 4, No. 1, 71-86

The Role of Blended Learning in Developing Students' Critical Thinking Skills in the Digital Age

[1]Didit Darmawan, [2]Reza Ahmad Zahid, [3]Abbas Sofwan Matlail Fajar

[1]Universitas Sunan Giri Surabaya

[2,3]Universitas Islam Tribakti Lirboyo Kediri

correspondence: dr.diditdarmawan@gmail.com

Abstract

This study aims to analyze the effectiveness of technology-based blended learning in fostering critical thinking skills among students, as well as to identify obstacles and solution strategies that can be implemented. The study was conducted through a literature review and analysis of best practices in the implementation of blended learning in educational institutions. The findings indicate that blended learning can enhance students' analytical, synthetic, argumentative, and critical reflective skills, provided it is supported by adequate digital literacy, equitable access to infrastructure, innovative instructional design, and an inclusive academic culture. Challenges include digital literacy gaps, limited devices, cultural resistance, and insufficient systematic evaluation. Solutions that can be implemented include strengthening technology training, providing infrastructure, developing adaptive education policies, and fostering cross-stakeholder collaboration. Evaluating the effectiveness of blended learning is the key to continuous improvement and ensuring the quality of critical thinking learning processes in the digital age.

Keywords: blended learning, educational technology, critical thinking, learning evaluation, digital education strategies.

Darmawan, D., R. A. Zahid, & A. S. M. Fajar. 2024. The Role of Blended Learning in Developing Learners' Critical Thinking Skills in the Digital Age, Studi Ilmu Sosial Indonesia, 4(1), 71-86.

Introduction

The paradigm shift in 21st-century education has brought about a growing demand for critical thinking skills in the global education landscape. The rapid advancement of digital technology has impacted conventional learning systems, compelling educational institutions to adapt to the new landscape to remain relevant. Adapting to digital innovations is not merely an option but a strategic necessity to ensure that the learning process remains effective and responsive to the evolving times. This shift presents a significant opportunity to enhance students' cognitive processes through the integration of technology into the learning system.

Blended learning, which combines online and face-to-face learning, presents opportunities to significantly improve students' critical thinking skills. This hybrid model is considered capable of providing flexibility and combining the advantages of traditional and digital learning, thereby encouraging students to be more active in finding solutions to learning problems. Bonk and Graham (2012) confirms that an approach integrating online and face-to-face aspects can create a richer learning environment, enabling students to engage with the material in a more comprehensive manner.

In particular, technological intervention in blended learning is believed to expand the cognitive exploration space of students. Technology provides facilities such as simulations, online discussions, and access to international scientific resources that stimulate the courage to ask and answer questions. Tavangarian et al. (2004) also concluded that the use of digital devices in hybrid learning systems encourages the creation of more prominent creative and reflective thinking dynamics in learners.

At the global level, improving critical thinking skills through blended learning has become a vital necessity. Today's competitive job market demands graduates with critical thinking, collaborative, creative, and communication skills. This is where the urgency lies that the role of technology in blended learning not only enriches the learning experience but also serves as a medium for strengthening the critical thinking foundations needed by future generations (Garrison & Kanuka, 2004). Although blended learning offers many advantages, a number of obstacles are still encountered in its implementation, especially in terms of developing critical thinking skills. Graham et al. (2013) identified that the shift from conventional to hybrid learning patterns often fails to encourage

students to actively develop the independence and reflective attitude that are essential for critical thinking. There are internal barriers in the form of students' lack of understanding of how to use educational technology effectively.

On the other hand, educators' readiness to manage blended learning is also a crucial issue. Arbaugh et al. (2010) state that not all educators have been optimally trained to utilize digital learning applications and platforms, so blended learning instruments are often not used to their full potential as tools for fostering critical thinking. Lack of training and internal institutional support are among the main causes of this problem. In addition to technical and pedagogical readiness, there are also infrastructure constraints that limit the effectiveness of blended learning implementation. Inconsistent institutional policies, limited internet access, and weak digital content curation are real obstacles (Porter et al., 2014). The imbalance between face-to-face and online learning can sometimes cause hybrid learning to fall short of expectations, thereby reducing its impact on the development of critical thinking skills.

Global changes in the field of education require comprehensive evaluation and research on the effectiveness of technology integration in blended learning. Careful analysis is needed to clarify the relationship between the use of technology and the improvement of critical thinking skills in learning. Without systematic observation, opportunities for improvement and the potential for optimal use of technology will be overlooked. Investment in technology-based learning innovation is growing, both from the private sector and the government. Observation of trends and the results of blended learning implementation can provide a clear picture of its effectiveness and impact on strengthening critical thinking in mass education. High-quality literature studies are needed to support the determination of future education policy directions.

This study aims to explore in detail how the use of technology in blended learning can improve students' critical thinking skills, analyze the factors that influence the success of critical thinking stimulation, and identify the obstacles encountered in the implementation of technology-based blended learning. It is expected to contribute critical academic references and serve as a reference in the development of educational policies to support the strengthening of critical thinking competencies in the digital age.

Method

The approach used in this study is a qualitative literature review that critically examines various literature related to technology integration in blended learning and the strengthening of critical thinking skills. This literature review focuses on document analysis, which involves analyzing scientific works such as indexed journals, books, and relevant research reports that discuss related topics. The scope of the literature review includes empirical research results, theoretical studies, and best practices in blended learning implementation. This qualitative analysis enables researchers to identify patterns, variable relationships, and various factors that influence the effectiveness of blended learning in enhancing critical thinking skills. This method has been recognized for its validity in exploring the complex relationship between technological tools, hybrid learning models, and students' cognitive outcomes (Creswell & Poth, 2018).

In an effort to maintain methodological integrity, the literature selection process was carried out systematically and through a rigorous screening process based on the relevance and validity of the sources. The selected literature must come from reputable publishers and be written by authors with credible academic track records in the fields of education and technology. This process follows the procedures outlined by Hart (1998), where the literature review process not only analyzes the content but also assesses the quality, authenticity, and contribution of each reference. The analytical model used combines thematic synthesis and interpretation to produce a more structured understanding of the effectiveness of technology in blended learning in fostering critical thinking.

Result and Discussion

The Application of Technology in Blended Learning to Strengthen Critical Thinking

Blended learning is an approach to education that combines online educational materials and opportunities for interaction online with traditional place-based classroom methods. It requires the physical presence of both a teacher and a student, with some elements of student control over time, place, path, or pace (Neiskashova et al., 2021). The implementation of technology in blended learning has opened up new opportunities for critical thinking transformation in educational settings.

Research by Garrison and Kanuka (2004) highlights that intensive interaction facilitated by digital devices in hybrid learning can create a participatory and reflective learning atmosphere. Through online discussions, collaborative forums, and e-learning platforms, students are more stimulated to formulate questions, analyze arguments, and synthesize information from various sources. This aligns with the theory of social constructivism, which emphasizes the importance of dialogue in the formation of new cognitive structures (Zahid & Darmawan, 2022). In blended learning, the use of technology increases interaction channels and accelerates the dissemination of information, thereby enabling the comprehensive development of students' analytical and critical thinking skills.

The implementation of a learning management system (LMS) is the backbone of adaptive hybrid learning. As discussed by Alammary et al. (2014), an LMS provides an organized platform for delivering material, practicing reflection, and providing constructive feedback. This platform is not merely a storage medium, but a digital collaboration space that requires student participation. Every online activity can be recorded, analyzed, and utilized to identify learning patterns and address individual needs for critical thinking development. This approach successfully offers a richer and more contextual learning experience.

The use of simulation-based technology and educational games has been proven to stimulate higher-order thinking processes. According to Hamari et al. (2014), gamification and interactive simulation elements can trigger intrinsic motivation and encourage learners to critically evaluate complex situations. Through virtual scenarios, learners are presented with problem-solving situations that require logical analysis and reasoning before making decisions. In this way, the technology-enhanced blended learning approach makes critical thinking no longer abstract but concrete and contextual. Critical thinking skills are the ability to think well and reflect on the thinking process itself (Megawati, 2022).

The importance of collaboration between students and educators in a digital learning environment was also raised by Hrastinski (2008). Collaboration facilitated through digital devices not only strengthens knowledge networks, but also hones analytical, assessment, and information synthesis skills. Each group member is encouraged to defend their arguments based on evidence, thereby fostering critical thinking in

an organic manner. The flexibility of time and space in blended learning enhances the likelihood of deep dialogue, which ultimately strengthens collective cognitive capacity.

An analysis by Chu et al. (2017) emphasizes the contribution of technology to higher-order thinking skills. The use of digital applications in blended learning encourages students to delay judgment, examine information from various dimensions, and ask critical questions about the assumptions presented in the learning material. With a dynamic online environment, students are encouraged to challenge the majority opinion or authority when they have strong arguments, thereby cultivating critical thinking skills more sharply.

Awareness of the use of technology in blended learning has brought about a paradigm shift in the role of educators to become facilitators of higher-level cognitive development. In a well-designed digital learning scenario, educators are able to design reflective activities, project-based learning, and analysis-based assessments, all of which are oriented toward strengthening critical thinking. The shift in instructional strategy from merely emphasizing mastery of material to fostering intellectual independence is an important achievement.

Develop effective blended learning that improves critical thinking skills and student achievement, several things need to be considered, namely: improving discipline in every school, adapting and maximizing facilities to be more up-to-date, aligning test formats consistently with the context of students, and updating learning formats in accordance with the needs and actual conditions of students (Deechai et al., 2019). It cannot be denied that the complexity of technology requires adequate infrastructure and pedagogy. The quality of blended learning is greatly determined by the careful selection of applications, technical support systems, and the relevance of digital content. Non-standardized technology devices can divert students' focus from critical thinking activities to mere digital routines with little added value. Therefore, every integration of technology should be directed toward outcomes that foster analytical and synthetic thinking, not merely the transfer of information.

In addition to technical aspects, the affective domain of learners needs attention in technology-based blended learning models. Learning motivation, self-regulation, and confidence in digital capabilities are key

assets for achieving educational goals. Teachers and lecturers must constantly evaluate the balance between challenges and support to ensure that blended learning is effective in stimulating curiosity, critical thinking, and critical evaluation. The suitability of the curriculum with the blended learning model is a key factor in the development of critical thinking skills. The curriculum should be designed so that students gain learning experiences through various activities, both in subjects and other activities at school (Sadieda et al., 2022). A curriculum that places too much emphasis on content without room for exploration limits students' freedom of thought. The combination of structured material and research-based assignments allows students to practice constructing arguments, comparing sources, and solving real-world problems.

The transformation to blended learning needs to be supported by a strong culture of digital literacy in the educational environment. Every academic is encouraged to be information literate, data literate, and accustomed to critically evaluating sources. As a culture of digital literacy grows, critical thinking is no longer just a curriculum requirement, but becomes a characteristic of active learners in the modern era. In addition to encouraging intellectual growth, the application of technology in blended learning has also built social and emotional networks among students.

Blended learning efficiency found that students who participated in blended learning achieved higher scores than students who participated in conventional learning, because it made students feel interested and enthusiastic about discovering new things by sharing knowledge with their friends (Eryilmaz, 2015). Through online discussions, virtual teamwork, and digital feedback, each student has an equal opportunity to express, evaluate, and critique their peers' opinions. These skills are important in preparing students to face the uncertainties of the future.

Overall, the implementation of technology in blended learning presents opportunities and challenges for educational institutions. With the right instructional design and the strengthening of digital competencies, blended learning has the potential to become an ecosystem for the growth and development of critical, creative, and reflective thinking skills. Consistent and adaptive innovation is needed so that blended learning can make a real contribution to achieving 21st-century educational goals.

Factors Determining the Success of Critical Thinking Stimulation Through Blended Learning

Critical success factors mainly include student characteristics, learning speed, commitment, attitude, motivation, cognition, computer efficacy and experience, and demographics. Most empirical studies have shown that learner characteristics determine the success of blended learning initiatives (Min & Yu, 2023). The success of blended learning in stimulating critical thinking processes is highly dependent on a number of significant factors. A study by Bernard et al. (2014) emphasizes that the quality of instructional design is one of the dominant variables in supporting the strengthening of students' analysis and evaluation skills. Systematically developed instructional materials that are relevant to real-life contexts and provide space for exploration form the primary foundation for cultivating critical thinking sensitivity. The presence of learning outcomes specifically designed for synthesis, analysis, and argumentation helps students focus on developing higher-order thinking skills.

Different technological preferences and skills among students can result in different attitudes, atmospheres, and learning performance. Therefore, educators must help eliminate or reduce the technological barriers experienced by students during the teaching and learning process (Jou et al., 2016). The role of educators as facilitators is also very influential in achieving the goals of blended learning. Shea et al. (2011) show that active guidance that supports reflective interaction can optimize the potential of students to test hypotheses, analyze evidence, and construct logical arguments. Educators' openness to various innovations, willingness to provide personalized guidance, and proficiency in using digital tools will enhance the effectiveness of the hybrid model in fostering a critical thinking environment. The development of educators' pedagogical competencies, particularly in the use of technology, must always be prioritized.

Most geographical areas still lack stable internet connectivity and adequate access to technology to successfully implement Blended Learning programs. Ensuring the provision of technological infrastructure can solve a large number of learning challenges. All of this can be achieved with transparent and strong federal government policies in each country

(Kumar et al., 2021). The availability of access to technology and digital infrastructure is also a very strategic factor in the process of stimulating critical thinking. According to Allen and Seaman (2013), the distribution of devices, the adequacy of internet networks, and the affordability of digital learning platforms greatly influence student participation and motivation. Inequality in access can hinder the equitable distribution of benefits from blended learning. In their survey, it was found that institutions capable of providing technical support, training, and adequate devices achieve more consistent success in developing critical thinking skills compared to those still constrained by digital infrastructure limitations.

Beyond technical aspects, the learning culture of students also plays a crucial role in determining the effectiveness of blended learning in fostering critical thinking. Habits such as independent learning, a love for knowledge, and the courage to ask critical questions must be consistently cultivated. An effective hybrid learning model requires students to actively manage their time, proactively seek additional information, and become accustomed to discussing topics both in person and online. These habits naturally build mental resilience in arguing and strengthen critical thinking skills to address various learning challenges.

Contextualizing learning materials with actual everyday issues encourages students to test theories in real-life situations. Through project-based assignments, case studies, and structured reflection, blended learning provides a multidisciplinary analysis tool that enriches cognitive experiences. The readiness of institutions to create an academic environment that supports collaborative activities will be an important factor in building a culture of critical thinking that is sustainable in the implementation of blended learning.

A highly participatory atmosphere is an indicator of the success of the blended learning model in stimulating critical thinking. Through online discussion forums, diverse inputs and different perspectives can be processed through constructive scientific argumentation. In this process, each student learns to respect the opinions of others while defending their own arguments with data and facts. The psychological readiness of students to accept changes in learning patterns is essential for adapting to blended learning. Psychological needs and blended learning are actually

interrelated. Blended learning provides a new dimension of interaction for students with different learning styles. Students' social interactions are no longer limited to the classroom. Academic results reveal another side of students that enables better relationships and interactions among them.

The results of blended learning can bring about a positive spiral of development, starting with recognition from others, then competence, which ultimately leads to identity formation (Wong, 2022). Intrinsic motivation will encourage them to be more active in seeking knowledge, experimenting, and building digital literacy. Strengthening these learning characteristics is a long-term investment in the development of a critical generation in the digital age. Leadership factors in educational institutions also have a significant influence on the implementation of blended learning. Institutions that are able to innovate policies, provide regular training, and build collaborative networks with various parties will find it easier to promote critical thinking. Bureaucracies that are too rigid or slow to respond to technological developments will slow down the achievement of blended learning-based educational goals (Barros et al., 2024). Supportive ecosystems, such as academic counseling services, resource centers, and study communities, enrich the blended learning experience that focuses on strengthening critical thinking. Each student has access to reliable learning resources, mentors, and broader opportunities for self-development outside of regular classes.

Continuous evaluation of blended learning processes and outcomes is one of the determining factors for developing adaptive and innovative programs. Data-driven monitoring and needs analysis provide a solid foundation for updating learning designs. Blended learning will be more effective when combined with a differentiated learning approach. Each student has different learning needs and preferences, so that enrichment of material, variation in methods, and flexibility in time can encourage the optimal achievement of critical thinking skills across a broad spectrum.

Ultimately, collaboration between educators, students, educational institutions, and external stakeholders is the cornerstone of successful blended learning for building an advanced, adaptive, and highly competitive critical thinking ecosystem in the global era.

Barriers to Technology Implementation in Blended Learning and Its Implications for Critical Thinking

The implementation of technology in blended learning is not without various obstacles that have the potential to hinder the achievement of critical thinking enhancement goals. There are numerous barriers with potential to impede the implementation of blended learning, specifically the e-learning aspect, that range from financial limitations, perceived barriers to poor infrastructure (Rensburg & Oguttu, 2022). One of the main obstacles identified in a number of studies is the difference in digital literacy levels among students and educators.

According to Redecker and Punie (2017), disparities in the ability to utilize digital devices and applications result in gaps in the learning process. As a result, efforts to stimulate critical thinking skills through blended learning cannot be optimized because not all individuals are able to access and manage technology equally and effectively.

With regard to digital technology, some of the barriers to blended learning adoption by teachers are their own inadequate or insufficient computer skills, lack of time to prepare new and appropriate teaching and learning materials, limited student access to technological resources, and lack of innovative teaching strategies to address digital issues (Vaughan et al., 2017). Another crucial factor stems from limited access to technology and digital infrastructure. The digital divide that still exists in various educational institutions means that not all students can participate in learning on an equal footing. Beetham and Sharpe (2013) emphasize that physical barriers such as unsupportive devices, as well as slow or unstable internet access, which directly hinder active participation in online discussions and technology-based assignments. This disrupts the chain of collaboration and the development of critical thinking skills, which should be accelerated through blended learning.

The social and cultural environment also plays an important role in determining the effectiveness of technology implementation in blended learning. An academic culture that is not yet fully adaptive to innovation and the reluctance of some educators to change teaching patterns are factors that slow down the adoption of blended learning as a whole. Kennedy et al. (2008) argue that resistance to change and the uneven distribution of digital-based pedagogical training increase the risk of

stagnation, resulting in blended learning remaining superficial and failing to produce significant impacts on the development of critical thinking skills.

The obstacles above show that the process of implementing ideal blended learning still requires systematic efforts to overcome the diversity of digital literacy and infrastructure in the educational environment. Not only that, the complexity of cultural change in the academic environment also requires consistent and sustainable change strategies. The lack of access to digital literacy training causes many educators to hesitate in utilizing new technological features, even though digital instructional innovation is one of the keys to the success of critical thinking development today.

Another common obstacle is the lack of institutional policy support for providing adequate blended learning facilities. Some educational institutions still consider investment in digital technology as a cost burden rather than a long-term investment in quality education. As a result, blended learning programs run with minimal resources and without systematic data-based evaluation. These limitations result in the achievement of critical thinking learning targets that are of uncertain quality and sustainability.

Psychological stress and a tendency to experience digital fatigue have also been identified in the implementation of technology-based blended learning. For instance, the use of videoconferencing tools was found to induce digital fatigue among university students, and it is impacting their emotional, motivational, and social well-being (Romero-Rodríguez et al., 2023). If this issue is not immediately addressed with flexible and attractive learning activities, it will distance students from reflective learning patterns and reduce their enthusiasm for developing critical thinking skills. High levels of distraction in the digital environment increase the likelihood of learning focus bias.

The changes in communication patterns resulting from the use of technology sometimes cause some students to lose confidence in expressing their ideas openly. Online learning with minimal verbal or face-to-face interaction often leads to miscommunication or even alienation for students who tend to learn by doing or are kinesthetic learners.

One of the prominent challenges in blended learning is the constraints and limitations caused by financial aspects, namely the varying and high costs of digital tools, meaning that not all students have adequate access to support the blended learning process optimally (Lazar et al., 2020). Financial barriers are also often one of the factors hindering the efficient implementation of blended learning. The cost of hardware, application subscriptions, and expensive internet connections place a heavy burden on students from lower-middle-income families. This socioeconomic inequality ultimately becomes a factor that contributes to disparities in critical thinking skills among students within a single educational institution.

The emergence of various learning applications also has the potential to cause confusion among students in determining quality learning resources. The abundance of choices without clear curation standards can actually reduce the effectiveness of learning and blur the focus on developing critical thinking skills. The lack of continuous monitoring and evaluation by educational institutions has resulted in the blended learning model developing without any real data on its effectiveness. The absence of valid data makes it difficult for institutions to identify areas that need improvement and innovation, resulting in slow progress in updating learning strategies.

Ultimately, the complexity of these constraints highlights the need for a multi-perspective approach and collaborative work across education stakeholders. A shared commitment from various lines, ranging from educators, students, institutions, to the government, is necessary so that the implementation of technology in blended learning can truly contribute significantly to strengthening critical thinking in the future.

Conclusion

The implementation of technology-based blended learning has been proven to significantly boost students' critical thinking skills. The success of blended learning utilization is greatly influenced by the quality of instructional design, equitable digital literacy, infrastructure support, and an academic culture that is adaptive to innovation. Challenges such as technological access gaps, resistance to change, and insufficient policy support can be addressed through digital literacy training, infrastructure

enhancement, and continuous evaluation. Systematic evaluation using indicators such as analytical skills, synthesis, argumentation, digital participation, and critical reflection serves as a crucial benchmark for program improvement. Collaboration among students, educators, institutions, and external stakeholders is key to creating an effective blended learning ecosystem that fosters a generation of highly competitive and critically thinking individuals in the digital age.

Recommendations that can be made in order to optimize blended learning and strengthen critical thinking are for educational institutions to prioritize the development of digital infrastructure and to conduct regular technology literacy training for educators and students. Educators are advised to continue to improve their competence in the use of learning technology, while also innovating to design collaborative instructional designs that stimulate critical thinking skills. Students are expected to actively build their own motivation to learn, be brave enough to engage in discussions and conduct critical reflections, and expand their digital knowledge so they can make the most of blended learning. On the other hand, policymakers are encouraged to strengthen regulations, expand subsidy programs, and establish partnerships with various stakeholders to ensure equitable access to technology and digital infrastructure. Further research on blended learning and critical thinking development should be conducted more empirically to identify innovative learning models relevant to current needs and societal developments.

References

Alammary, A., Sheard, J., & Carbone, A. 2014. Blended Learning in Higher Education: Three Different Design Approaches. *Australasian Journal of Educational Technology*, *30*(4), 440–454. https://doi.org/10.14742/ajet.693

Allen, I. E., & Seaman, J. 2013. *Changing Course: Ten Years of Tracking Online Education in the United States*. Sloan Consortium.

Arbaugh, J. B., Desai, A., Rau, B., & Sridhar, B. S. 2010. A Review of Research on Online and Blended Learning in the Management Disciplines: 1994–2009. *Organization Management Journal*, *7*(1), 39–55..

Barros, F. R. D., Oliveira, J. V. F. D., Lima, H. D. C. G., Faustino, L. R., & Muglia, T. B. 2024. Overcoming Bureaucracy in Higher Education Institutions: A Systematic Literature Review. *Educationis*, *12*(2), 33–44.

Beetham, H., & Sharpe, R. 2013. *Rethinking Pedagogy for a Digital Age: Designing for 21st Century Learning*. Routledge.

Bernard, R. M., Borokhovski, E., Schmid, R. F., Tamim, R. M., & Abrami, P. C. 2014. A Meta-Analysis of Blended Learning and Technology Use in Higher Education: From the General to the Applied. *Journal of Computing in Higher Education*, *26*(1), 87–122. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12528-013-9077-3

Bonk, C. J., & Graham, C. R. 2012. *The Handbook of Blended Learning: Global Perspectives, Local Designs*. John Wiley & Sons.

Chu, S. K. W., Reynolds, R. B., Tavares, N. J., Notari, M., & Lee, C. W. Y. 2017. *21st Century Skills Development Through Inquiry-Based Learning*. Springer Singapore. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-10-2481-8

Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. 2018. *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing among Five Approaches* (4th ed.). Sage Publications.

Deechai, W., Sovajassatakul, T., & Petsangsri, S. 2019. The Need for Blended Learning Development to Enhance the Critical Thinking of Thai Vocational Students. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, *10*(1), 131–140. https://doi.org/10.2478/mjss-2019-0013

Eryilmaz, M. 2015. The Effectiveness of Blended Learning Environments. *Contemporary Issues in Education Research (CIER)*, *8*(4), 251–256. https://doi.org/10.19030/cier.v8i4.9433

Garrison, D. R., & Kanuka, H. 2004. Blended Learning: Uncovering Its Transformative Potential in Higher Education. *The Internet and Higher Education*, *7*(2), 95–105. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.iheduc.2004.02.001

Graham, C. R., Woodfield, W., & Harrison, J. B. 2013. A Framework for Institutional Adoption and Implementation of Blended Learning in Higher Education. *The Internet and Higher Education*, *18*, 4–14.

Hamari, J., Koivisto, J., & Sarsa, H. 2014. Does Gamification Work? -- A Literature Review of Empirical Studies on Gamification. *2014 47th Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences*, 3025–3034.

Hart, C. 1998. *Doing a Literature Review: Releasing the Social Science Research Imagination*. Sage Publications.

Hrastinski, S. 2008. Asynchronous and Synchronous E-Learning. *Educause Quarterly*, *31*(4), 51–55.

Jou, M., Lin, Y.-T., & Wu, D.-W. 2016. Effect of a Blended Learning Environment on Student Critical Thinking and Knowledge Transformation. *Interactive Learning Environments*, *24*(6), 1131–1147.

Kennedy, G. E., Judd, T. S., Churchward, A., Gray, K., & Krause, K.-L. 2008. First Year Students' Experiences with Technology: Are They Really Digital Natives? *Australasian Journal of Educational Technology*, *24*(1). https://doi.org/10.14742/ajet.1233

Kumar, A., Krishnamurthi, R., Bhatia, S., Kaushik, K., Ahuja, N. J., Nayyar, A., & Masud, M. 2021. Blended Learning Tools and Practices: A Comprehensive Analysis. *IEEE Access*, *9*, 85151–85197.

Kurniawan, Y., & D. Darmawan. 2021. The Adaptive Learning Effect on Individual and Collecting Learning, *Journal of Social Science Studies*, 1(1), 93 – 98.

Lazar, I. M., Panisoara, G., & Panisoara, I. O. 2020. Digital Technology Adoption Scale in the Blended Learning Context in Higher Education: Development, Validation and Testing of a Specific Tool. *PLOS ONE*, *15*(7), e0235957. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0235957

Megawati, R. 2022. Penerapan Metode Blended Learning untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar dan Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis Mahasiswa. *J-HEST Journal of Health Education Economics Science and Technology*, *4*(1), 40–45. https://doi.org/10.36339/jhest.v4i1.64

Min, W., & Yu, Z. 2023. A Systematic Review of Critical Success Factors in Blended Learning. *Education Sciences*, *13*(5), 469.

Neiskashova, E. V., Fomina, T. N., & Glebova, D. V. 2021. *Blended Learning and Critical Thinking*. 1301–1311. https://doi.org/10.15405/epsbs.2021.09.02.146

Porter, W. W., Graham, C. R., Spring, K. A., & Welch, K. R. 2014. Blended Learning in Higher Education: Institutional Adoption and Implementation. *Computers & Education*, *75*, 185–195. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2014.02.011

Redecker, C., & Punie, Y. 2017. *Digital Competence of Educators: Concepts, Policies and Practice*. Publications Office of the European Union.

Rensburg, E. J. V., & Oguttu, J. W. 2022. Blended Teaching and Learning: Exploring the Concept, Barriers to Implementation and Designing of Learning Resources. *South African Journal of Higher Education*, *36*(6), 285–296. https://doi.org/10.20853/36-6-4595

Romero-Rodríguez, J.-M., Hinojo-Lucena, F.-J., Kopecký, K., & García-González, A. 2023. Digital Fatigue in University Students as a Consequence of Online Learning During the Covid-19 Pandemic. *Educación XX1*, *26*(2), 165–184. https://doi.org/10.5944/educxx1.34530

Sadieda, L. U., Wahyudi, B., Dwi Kirana, R., Kamaliyyah, S., & Arsyavina, V. 2022. Implementasi Model Blended Learning pada Pembelajaran Matematika Berbasis Kurikulum Merdeka. *JRPM (Jurnal Review Pembelajaran Matematika)*, *7*(1), 55–72. https://doi.org/10.15642/jrpm.2022.7.1.55-72

Shea, P., Bidjerano, T., & Vickers, J. 2011. Online Course Design as a Significant Variable in Student Satisfaction. *Online Learning*, *15*(4), 65–88.

Tavangarian, D., Leypold, M. E., Nolting, K., & Roser, M. 2004. Is E-Learning the Solution for Individual Learning. *The Electronic Journal of E-Learning*, *2*(2), 273–280.

Vaughan, N. D., Reali, A., Stenbom, S., Vuuren, M. J. V., & MacDonald, D. 2017. Blended Learning From Design to Evaluation: International Case Studies of Evidence-Based Practice. *Online Learning*, *21*(3). https://doi.org/10.24059/olj.v21i3.1252

Zahid, R. A. & D. Darmawan. 2022. Analyze the Effect of Social Stereotypes on Intergroup Relations in Society and Social Equality, *Journal of Social Science Studies*, 2(2), 195 – 200.